## What are continuously differentiable functions on compact sets?

L. Loosveldt (Aspirant FNRS)

Joint work with
Leonhard Frerick and Jochen Wengenroth (Universität Trier)

International Conference on Generalized Functions

Ghent - August 31

- LIÈGE université Mathématique

Let $K$ be a compact set of $\mathbb{R}^{d}$,

Let $K$ be a compact set of $\mathbb{R}^{d}$,

A function $f$, continuous on $K$, belongs to $C^{1}(K)$ if there exits a continuous function $d f$ on $K$ with values in the linear maps from $\mathbb{R}^{d}$ to $\mathbb{R}$ such that, for all $x \in K$,

$$
\lim _{\substack{y \rightarrow x \\ y \in K}} \frac{f(y)-f(x)-\langle d f(x), y-x\rangle}{|y-x|}=0,
$$

Let $K$ be a compact set of $\mathbb{R}^{d}$,

A function $f$, continuous on $K$, belongs to $C^{1}(K)$ if there exits a continuous function $d f$ on $K$ with values in the linear maps from $\mathbb{R}^{d}$ to $\mathbb{R}$ such that, for all $x \in K$,

$$
\lim _{\substack{y \rightarrow x \\ y \in K}} \frac{f(y)-f(x)-\langle d f(x), y-x\rangle}{|y-x|}=0,
$$

!! In general, such a derivative needs not be unique !!

Let $K$ be a compact set of $\mathbb{R}^{d}$,

A function $f$, continuous on $K$, belongs to $C^{1}(K)$ if there exits a continuous function $d f$ on $K$ with values in the linear maps from $\mathbb{R}^{d}$ to $\mathbb{R}$ such that, for all $x \in K$,

$$
\lim _{\substack{y \rightarrow x \\ y \in K}} \frac{f(y)-f(x)-\langle d f(x), y-x\rangle}{|y-x|}=0,
$$

!! In general, such a derivative needs not be unique !!
$\mathcal{J}^{1}(K):=\left\{(f ; d f) \in C(K)^{d+1}: d f\right.$ is a continuous derivative of $f$ on $\left.K\right\}$ endowed with the norm

$$
\|(f ; d f)\|_{\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)}=\|f\|_{K}+\|d f\|_{K}
$$

Let $K$ be a compact set of $\mathbb{R}^{d}$,

A function $f$, continuous on $K$, belongs to $C^{1}(K)$ if there exits a continuous function $d f$ on $K$ with values in the linear maps from $\mathbb{R}^{d}$ to $\mathbb{R}$ such that, for all $x \in K$,

$$
\lim _{\substack{y \rightarrow x \\ y \in K}} \frac{f(y)-f(x)-\langle d f(x), y-x\rangle}{|y-x|}=0
$$

!! In general, such a derivative needs not be unique !!

$$
C^{1}(K)=\pi_{1}\left(\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)\right),
$$

endowed with the norm
$\|f\|_{C^{1}(K)}=\|f\|_{K}+\inf \left\{\|d f\|_{K}: d f\right.$ is a continuous derivative of $f$ on $\left.K\right\}$
$C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)$ is the subset of $C^{1}(K)$ of the restriction on $K$ of continuously differentiable function on $\mathbb{R}^{d}$.
$C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)$ is the subset of $C^{1}(K)$ of the restriction on $K$ of continuously differentiable function on $\mathbb{R}^{d}$.

$$
C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right) \subsetneq C^{1}(K)
$$

$C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)$ is the subset of $C^{1}(K)$ of the restriction on $K$ of continuously differentiable function on $\mathbb{R}^{d}$.

$$
C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right) \subsetneq C^{1}(K)
$$



$$
K=\left\{(x, y) \in[-1,1]^{2}:|y| \geq x^{3} \text { for } x \geq 0\right\}
$$

$$
f(x, y)=x^{2} \text { on the red part } f(x, y)=0 \text { otherwise }
$$

$f \in C^{1}(K)$ but $f \notin C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{2} \mid K\right)$ because $f$ is not Lipschitz continuous near the origin.

## Theorem (Whitney, 1934)

A function $f \in C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)$ if and only if $f \in \pi_{1}\left(\mathscr{E}^{1}(K)\right)$
A jet $(f, d f) \in \mathscr{E}^{1}(K)$ if

$$
\lim _{\substack{y \rightarrow x \\ y \in K}} \frac{f(y)-f(x)-\langle d f(x), y-x\rangle}{|y-x|}=0 .
$$

uniformly on $x \in K$.

## Theorem (Whitney, 1934)

A function $f \in C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)$ if and only if $f \in \pi_{1}\left(\mathscr{E}^{1}(K)\right)$
A jet $(f, d f) \in \mathscr{E}^{1}(K)$ if

$$
\lim _{\substack{y \rightarrow x \\ y \in K}} \frac{f(y)-f(x)-\langle d f(x), y-x\rangle}{|y-x|}=0 .
$$

uniformly on $x \in K$.
If $K$ is topologically regular $(\stackrel{\stackrel{\circ}{K}}{K}=K)$
$C_{\text {int }}^{1}(K)=\left\{f \in C^{1}(\stackrel{\circ}{K}): f\right.$ and $\partial_{j} f$ extend continously to $\left.K, 1 \leq j \leq d\right\}$.

## Theorem (Whitney, 1934)

A function $f \in C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)$ if and only if $f \in \pi_{1}\left(\mathscr{E}^{1}(K)\right)$
A jet $(f, d f) \in \mathscr{E}^{1}(K)$ if

$$
\lim _{\substack{y \rightarrow x \\ y \in K}} \frac{f(y)-f(x)-\langle d f(x), y-x\rangle}{|y-x|}=0 .
$$

uniformly on $x \in K$.
If $K$ is topologically regular $(\stackrel{\circ}{K}=K)$
$C_{\text {int }}^{1}(K)=\left\{f \in C^{1}(\stackrel{\circ}{K}): f\right.$ and $\partial_{j} f$ extend continously to $\left.K, 1 \leq j \leq d\right\}$.

$$
C^{1}(K) \subseteq C_{\mathrm{int}}^{1}(K)
$$

## Compact set with infinitely many connected components

If $K$ is a compact set with infinitely many connected components, then $\left(C^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{C^{1}(K)}\right)$ is incomplete.

## Compact set with infinitely many connected components

If $K$ is a compact set with infinitely many connected components, then $\left(C^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{C^{1}(K)}\right)$ is incomplete.
(1) $\left(K_{j}\right)_{j \in \mathbb{N}}$ of pairwise disjoints clopen subsets of $K$ with infinitely many connected components. For each $j \in \mathbb{N}$, let $x_{j} \in K_{j}$.

## Compact set with infinitely many connected components

If $K$ is a compact set with infinitely many connected components, then $\left(C^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{C^{1}(K)}\right)$ is incomplete.
(1) $\left(K_{j}\right)_{j \in \mathbb{N}}$ of pairwise disjoints clopen subsets of $K$ with infinitely many connected components. For each $j \in \mathbb{N}$, let $x_{j} \in K_{j}$.
(2) Extract a convergent subsequence $x_{k(j)} \rightarrow x_{0} \in K$, this limit cannot belong to one of the $K_{k(j)}$ as those subsets are open and pairwise disjoint.

## Compact set with infinitely many connected components

If $K$ is a compact set with infinitely many connected components, then $\left(C^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{C^{1}(K)}\right)$ is incomplete.
(1) $\left(K_{j}\right)_{j \in \mathbb{N}}$ of pairwise disjoints clopen subsets of $K$ with infinitely many connected components. For each $j \in \mathbb{N}$, let $x_{j} \in K_{j}$.
(2) Extract a convergent subsequence $x_{k(j)} \rightarrow x_{0} \in K$, this limit cannot belong to one of the $K_{k(j)}$ as those subsets are open and pairwise disjoint.
©

$$
f_{n}(x)=\left\{\begin{array}{cl}
\left|x_{k(j)}-x_{0}\right| & \text { if } x \in K_{k(j)} \text { and } j \leq n \\
0 & \text { if } x \in K \backslash \bigcup_{j=1}^{n} K_{k(j)} .
\end{array}\right.
$$

$f_{n}$ is a Cauchy sequence in $\left(C^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{C^{1}(K)}\right)$.

If $K$ has finitely many connected components

If $K$ has finitely many connected components


If $K$ has finitely many connected components


We say that a set $A \subseteq \mathbb{R}^{d}$ is (Whitney) regular if there exists $C>0$ such that any two points $x, y \in A$ can be joined by a rectifiable path in $A$ of length bounded by $C|x-y|$.

If $K$ has finitely many connected components


We say that $A$ is pointwise (Whitney) regular if for any $x \in A$ there exists a neighbourhood $V_{x}$ of $x$ in $A$ and $C_{x}>0$ such that any $y \in V_{x}$ is joined to $x$ by a rectifiable path in $A$ of length bounded by $C_{x}|x-y|$.

If $K$ has finitely many connected components


If $K$ has finitely many connected components


If $K$ has finitely many connected components


## Generalized F.T.C. (L. Frerick, L.L., J. Wengenroth)

For each $f \in C^{1}(K)$ with a continuous derivative $d f$ and each rectifiable path $\gamma:[a, b] \rightarrow K$ we have

$$
\int_{\gamma} d f=f(\gamma(b))-f(\gamma(a)) .
$$

If $K$ has finitely many connected components

$\sup _{\substack{y \in K \\ y \neq x}} \frac{|f(y)-f(x)|}{|y-x|} \leq C_{x}\|f\|_{C^{1}(K)}$
(1) Take $\left(\left(f_{j} ; d f_{j}\right)\right)_{j \in \mathbb{N}}$ a Cauchy sequence in $\left(\mathcal{J}^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)}\right)$, from the completeness of $\left(C(K),\|\cdot\|_{K}\right)$ we obtain uniforms limits $f$ and $d f$.
(2) Given $x \in K$ and a path $\gamma_{y}$ from $x$ to $y$ of length $L\left(\gamma_{y}\right) \leq C_{x}|x-y|$

$$
f_{j}(y)-f_{j}(x)-\langle d f(x), y-x\rangle=\int_{\gamma_{y}}\left(d f_{j}-d f(x)\right)
$$

If $K$ has finitely many connected components

$$
\text { For all } x \in K \text {, there exists }
$$

$$
\begin{array}{cc}
\Rightarrow & \left(\mathcal{J}^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)}\right) \text { B.S. } \\
\neq & \left(C^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{C^{1}(K)}\right) \text { B.S. }
\end{array}
$$ $C_{x}>0$ such that

$\sup _{\substack{y \in K \\ y \neq x}} \frac{|f(y)-f(x)|}{|y-x|} \leq C_{x}\|f\|_{C^{1}(K)}$
(1) Take $\left(\left(f_{j} ; d f_{j}\right)\right)_{j \in \mathbb{N}}$ a Cauchy sequence in $\left(\mathcal{J}^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)}\right)$, from the completeness of $\left(C(K),\|\cdot\|_{K}\right)$ we obtain uniforms limits $f$ and $d f$.
(2) Given $x \in K$ and a path $\gamma_{y}$ from $x$ to $y$ of length $L\left(\gamma_{y}\right) \leq C_{x}|x-y|$

$$
f(y)-f(x)-\langle d f(x), y-x\rangle=\int_{\gamma_{y}}(d f-d f(x))
$$

If $K$ has finitely many connected components


By taking the quotient map

If $K$ has finitely many connected components
$K$ is pointwise regular $\quad \Rightarrow \quad\left(\mathcal{J}^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)}\right)$ B.S.
$\Downarrow$
For all $x \in K$, there exists $\Leftarrow\left(C^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{C^{1}(K)}\right)$ B.S.
$C_{x}>0$ such that $\sup _{\substack{y \in K \\ y \neq x}} \frac{|f(y)-f(x)|}{|y-x|} \leq C_{x}\|f\|_{C^{1}(K)}$

If $K$ has finitely many connected components
$K$ is pointwise regular $\quad \Rightarrow \quad\left(\mathcal{J}^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)}\right) B . S$.
For all $x \in K$, there exists $\Leftarrow\left(C^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{C^{1}(K)}\right)$ B.S.
$C_{x}>0$ such that
$\sup _{\substack{y \in K \\ y \neq x}} \frac{|f(y)-f(x)|}{|y-x|} \leq C_{x}\|f\|_{C^{1}(K)}$
We fix $x \in K$, for all $y \in K \backslash\{x\}$, we define a linear and continuous functional on $C^{1}(K)$ by

$$
\Phi_{y}(f)=\frac{f(y)-f(x)}{|y-x|} \quad \forall f \in C^{1}(K) .
$$

Conclusion by Uniform boudedness principle.

If $K$ has finitely many connected components $K$ is pointwise regular $\quad \Rightarrow \quad\left(\mathcal{J}^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)}\right)$ B.S.
For all $x \in K$, there exists
\# $C^{1}(K), \|$
$C_{x}>0$ such that $\sup _{\substack{y \in K \\ y \neq x}} \frac{|f(y)-f(x)|}{|y-x|} \leq C_{x}\|f\|_{C^{1}(K)}$

If $K$ has finitely many connected components
$K$ is pointwise regular $\Uparrow$
For all $x \in K$, there exists
$C_{x}>0$ such that $\sup _{\substack{y \in \in x \\ y \neq \neq \geq}} \frac{|f(y)-f(x)|}{|y-x|} \leq C_{x}\|f\|_{C^{1}(K)}$
$\Rightarrow \quad\left(\mathcal{J}^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)}\right)$ B.S.
\# $\downarrow$
$\Leftarrow\left(C^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{C^{1}(K)}\right)$ B.S.

If $K$ has finitely many connected components

$d_{\varepsilon}(y):=\inf \left\{L_{\gamma}: \gamma\right.$ rectifiable path from $x$ to $y$ in $\left.K_{2 \varepsilon}\right\}$.
( $K_{2 \varepsilon}$ open connected neighbourhood of $K$ )

If $K$ has finitely many connected components
$K$ is pointwise regular $\Uparrow$
For all $x \in K$, there exists $C_{x}>0$ such that
$\sup _{\substack{y \in K \\ y \neq x}} \frac{|f(y)-f(x)|}{|y-x|} \leq C_{x}\|f\|_{C^{1}(K)}$

$$
\begin{array}{cc}
\Rightarrow & \left(\mathcal{J}^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)}\right) \text { B.S. } \\
\nVdash & \Downarrow
\end{array}
$$

$$
\Leftarrow\left(C^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{C^{1}(K)}\right) \text { B.S. }
$$

$$
d_{\varepsilon}(y):=\inf \left\{L_{\gamma}: \gamma \text { rectifiable path from } x \text { to } y \text { in } K_{2 \varepsilon}\right\}
$$

$y_{0} \in K$ fixed, set $u_{\varepsilon}(y)=\min \left\{d_{\varepsilon}(y), d_{\varepsilon}\left(y_{0}\right)\right\}$. If $y$ and $y^{\prime}$ are closed enough in $K_{2 \varepsilon}$, we have

$$
\left|u_{\varepsilon}(y)-u_{\varepsilon}\left(y^{\prime}\right)\right| \leq\left|y-y^{\prime}\right|
$$

If $K$ has finitely many connected components
$K$ is pointwise regular

For all $x \in K$, there exists $C_{x}>0$ such that $\sup _{\substack{y \in K \\ y \neq x}} \frac{|f(y)-f(x)|}{|y-x|} \leq C_{x}\|f\|_{C^{1}(K)}$

$\left(C^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{C^{1}(K)}\right)$ B.S.
$d_{\varepsilon}(y):=\inf \left\{L_{\gamma}: \gamma\right.$ rectifiable path from $x$ to $y$ in $\left.K_{2 \varepsilon}\right\}$.
$y_{0} \in K$ fixed, set $u_{\varepsilon}(y)=\min \left\{d_{\varepsilon}(y), d_{\varepsilon}\left(y_{0}\right)\right\}$. If $\phi$ is a positive smooth function with support in $B(0, \varepsilon)$ and integral 1 , the convolution $u_{\varepsilon} * \phi$, defined in $K_{\varepsilon}$, is a smooth function.

$$
\left|\left(u_{\varepsilon} * \phi\right)(x)-\left(u_{\varepsilon} * \phi\right)\left(y_{0}\right)\right| \leq C_{x}\left(d_{\varepsilon}\left(y_{0}\right)+d\right)\left|x-y_{0}\right|
$$

If $K$ has finitely many connected components


For all $x \in K$, there exists $C_{x}>0$ such that
$\sup _{\substack{y \in K \\ y \neq x}} \frac{|f(y)-f(x)|}{|y-x|} \leq C_{x}\|f\|_{C^{1}(K)}$

$\left(C^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{C^{1}(K)}\right) B . S$.

$$
d_{\varepsilon}(y):=\inf \left\{L_{\gamma}: \gamma \text { rectifiable path from } x \text { to } y \text { in } K_{2 \varepsilon}\right\} .
$$

$y_{0} \in K$ fixed
$\operatorname{supp} \phi \rightarrow\{0\}$

$$
d_{\varepsilon}\left(y_{0}\right) \leq C_{x}\left(d_{\varepsilon}\left(y_{0}\right)+d\right)\left|x-y_{0}\right| .
$$

## If $K$ has finitely many connected components



For any $y_{0} \in B\left(x, \frac{1}{2 C_{x}}\right) \cap K$, there exists a rectifiable path from $x$ to $y_{0}$ in $K_{2 \varepsilon}$ of length bounded by $2 C_{x} d\left|x-y_{0}\right|+\varepsilon$. Using a parametrization by arc length for these paths gives an uniformly equicontinuous and uniformly bounded family of functions.
By Arzelà-Ascoli Theorem, we find a convergent subsequence an the limit is a path of length bounded by $2 C_{x} d\left|x-y_{0}\right|$.

## Characterization of the completness of $C^{1}(K)$ (L. Frerick, L.L., J. Wengenroth)

Let $K$ be a compact set, $\left(C^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{C^{1}(K)}\right)$ is a Banach space if and only if $K$ has finitely many components which are pointwise Whitney regular.

We want to show that

$$
{\overline{C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)}}^{C^{1}(K)}=C^{1}(K) .
$$

We want to show that

$$
\overline{\mathscr{E}}(K)^{\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)}=\mathcal{J}^{1}(K) .
$$

We want to show that

$$
{\overline{\mathscr{E}}{ }^{1}(K)}^{\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)}=\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)
$$

For general $K$, all standard approximation procedures like convolution with smooth bump functions or gluing of local approximation with partition of unity do not apply easily.

We want to show that

$$
\overline{\mathscr{E}^{1}(K)} \mathcal{J}^{1}(K)=\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)
$$

For general $K$, all standard approximation procedures like convolution with smooth bump functions or gluing of local approximation with partition of unity do not apply easily.

Consequence of Hahn-Banach theorem
It suffices to check that, if $\Phi$ is a bounded linear functional on $C(K)^{d+1}$ such that $\Phi_{\mid \mathscr{C}^{1}(K)}=0$ then $\Phi_{\mid \mathcal{J}^{1}(K)}=0$

We want to show that

$$
{\overline{\mathscr{E}}{ }^{1}(K)}^{\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)}=\mathcal{J}^{1}(K)
$$

For general $K$, all standard approximation procedures like convolution with smooth bump functions or gluing of local approximation with partition of unity do not apply easily.

Consequence of Hahn-Banach theorem
It suffices to check that, if $\Phi$ is a bounded linear functional on $C(K)^{d+1}$ such that $\Phi_{\mid \mathscr{C}^{1}(K)}=0$ then $\Phi_{\mid \mathcal{J}^{1}(K)}=0$

We consider such a $\Phi$.

Thanks to Riesz representation theorem, $\Phi$ is represented by $\left(\mu ; \mu_{1}, \cdots, \mu_{d}\right)$ : for all $\left(f, f_{1}, \cdots, f_{d}\right) \in C(K)^{d+1}$,

$$
\Phi\left(\left(f, f_{1}, \cdots, f_{d}\right)\right)=\int f d \mu+\int f_{1} d \mu_{1}+\ldots+\int f_{d} d \mu_{d} .
$$

Thanks to Riesz representation theorem, $\Phi$ is represented by $\left(\mu ; \mu_{1}, \cdots, \mu_{d}\right)$ : for all $\left(f, f_{1}, \cdots, f_{d}\right) \in C(K)^{d+1}$,

$$
\Phi\left(\left(f, f_{1}, \cdots, f_{d}\right)\right)=\int f d \mu+\int f_{1} d \mu_{1}+\ldots+\int f_{d} d \mu_{d} .
$$

Thanks to Riesz representation theorem, $\Phi$ is represented by $\left(\mu ; \mu_{1}, \cdots, \mu_{d}\right)$ : for all $\left(f, f_{1}, \cdots, f_{d}\right) \in C(K)^{d+1}$,

$$
\Phi\left(\left(f, f_{1}, \cdots, f_{d}\right)\right)=\int f d \mu+\int f_{1} d \mu_{1}+\ldots+\int f_{d} d \mu_{d}
$$

As, $\Phi_{\mid \mathscr{C}^{1}(K)}=0$, for all $\varphi \in \mathcal{D}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d}\right)$, we have

$$
\int \varphi d \mu=-\int \partial_{1} \varphi d \mu_{1}-\cdots-\int \partial_{d} \varphi d \mu_{d}
$$

Thanks to Riesz representation theorem, $\Phi$ is represented by $\left(\mu ; \mu_{1}, \cdots, \mu_{d}\right)$ : for all $\left(f, f_{1}, \cdots, f_{d}\right) \in C(K)^{d+1}$,

$$
\Phi\left(\left(f, f_{1}, \cdots, f_{d}\right)\right)=\int f d \mu+\int f_{1} d \mu_{1}+\ldots+\int f_{d} d \mu_{d}
$$

As, $\Phi_{\mid \mathscr{C}^{1}(K)}=0$, for all $\varphi \in \mathcal{D}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d}\right)$, we have

$$
\mu[\varphi]=\left(\partial_{1} \mu_{1}\right)[\varphi]+\cdots+\left(\partial_{d} \mu_{d}\right)[\varphi]
$$

Thanks to Riesz representation theorem, $\Phi$ is represented by $\left(\mu ; \mu_{1}, \cdots, \mu_{d}\right)$ : for all $\left(f, f_{1}, \cdots, f_{d}\right) \in C(K)^{d+1}$,

$$
\begin{gathered}
\Phi\left(\left(f, f_{1}, \cdots, f_{d}\right)\right)=\int f d \mu+\int f_{1} d \mu_{1}+\ldots+\int f_{d} d \mu_{d} . \\
\mu=\operatorname{div}(T)
\end{gathered}
$$

where $T=\left(\mu_{1}, \cdots, \mu_{d}\right)$ is a vector-field of measures (charge).

If $\gamma:[a, b] \rightarrow K$ is a (Lipschitz) path and $F=\left(F_{1}, \cdots, F_{d}\right) \in C(K)^{d}$,
$\int_{\gamma} F=\int_{a}^{b}\left\langle F(\gamma(t)), \gamma^{\prime}(t)\right\rangle d t$

If $\gamma:[a, b] \rightarrow K$ is a (Lipschitz) path and $F=\left(F_{1}, \cdots, F_{d}\right) \in C(K)^{d}$,
$\int_{\gamma} F=\int_{a}^{b}\left\langle F(\gamma(t)), \gamma^{\prime}(t)\right\rangle d t=\sum_{j=1}^{d} \int_{a}^{b} F_{j}(\gamma(t)) \gamma_{j}^{\prime}(t) d t$

If $\gamma:[a, b] \rightarrow K$ is a (Lipschitz) path and
$F=\left(F_{1}, \cdots, F_{d}\right) \in C(K)^{d}$,
$\int_{\gamma} F=\int_{a}^{b}\left\langle F(\gamma(t)), \gamma^{\prime}(t)\right\rangle d t=\sum_{j=1}^{d} \int_{a}^{b} F_{j}(\gamma(t)) \gamma_{j}^{\prime}(t) d t=\sum_{j=1}^{d} \int F_{j} d \mu_{j}^{(\gamma)}$,
where $\mu_{j}^{(\gamma)}$ is the image under $\gamma$ of the measure with density $\gamma_{j}^{\prime}$ on
[a, b].

If $\gamma:[a, b] \rightarrow K$ is a (Lipschitz) path and
$F=\left(F_{1}, \cdots, F_{d}\right) \in C(K)^{d}$,
$\int_{\gamma} F=\int_{a}^{b}\left\langle F(\gamma(t)), \gamma^{\prime}(t)\right\rangle d t=\sum_{j=1}^{d} \int_{a}^{b} F_{j}(\gamma(t)) \gamma_{j}^{\prime}(t) d t=\sum_{j=1}^{d} \int F_{j} d \mu_{j}^{(\gamma)}$,
where $\mu_{j}^{(\gamma)}$ is the image under $\gamma$ of the measure with density $\gamma_{j}^{\prime}$ on
$[a, b]$. We set $T_{\gamma}=\left(\mu_{1}^{(\gamma)}, \cdots, \mu_{d}^{(\gamma)}\right)$

If $\gamma:[a, b] \rightarrow K$ is a (Lipschitz) path and
$F=\left(F_{1}, \cdots, F_{d}\right) \in C(K)^{d}$,
$\int_{\gamma} F=\int_{a}^{b}\left\langle F(\gamma(t)), \gamma^{\prime}(t)\right\rangle d t=\sum_{j=1}^{d} \int_{a}^{b} F_{j}(\gamma(t)) \gamma_{j}^{\prime}(t) d t=\sum_{j=1}^{d} \int F_{j} d \mu_{j}^{(\gamma)}$,
where $\mu_{j}^{(\gamma)}$ is the image under $\gamma$ of the measure with density $\gamma_{j}^{\prime}$ on
$[a, b]$. We set $T_{\gamma}=\left(\mu_{1}^{(\gamma)}, \cdots, \mu_{d}^{(\gamma)}\right)$,

$$
\operatorname{div} T_{\gamma}=\delta_{a}-\delta_{b}
$$

If $\gamma:[a, b] \rightarrow K$ is a (Lipschitz) path and
$F=\left(F_{1}, \cdots, F_{d}\right) \in C(K)^{d}$,
$\int_{\gamma} F=\int_{a}^{b}\left\langle F(\gamma(t)), \gamma^{\prime}(t)\right\rangle d t=\sum_{j=1}^{d} \int_{a}^{b} F_{j}(\gamma(t)) \gamma_{j}^{\prime}(t) d t=\sum_{j=1}^{d} \int F_{j} d \mu_{j}^{(\gamma)}$,
where $\mu_{j}^{(\gamma)}$ is the image under $\gamma$ of the measure with density $\gamma_{j}^{\prime}$ on $[a, b]$. We set $T_{\gamma}=\left(\mu_{1}^{(\gamma)}, \cdots, \mu_{d}^{(\gamma)}\right)$,

$$
\operatorname{div} T_{\gamma}=\delta_{a}-\delta_{b}
$$

If $\Gamma$ is the set of all Lipschitz paths.

## Smirnov (1993)

Every charge $T$ with compact support such that $\operatorname{div}(T)$ is a signed measure can be decomposed into elements of $\Gamma$, i.e., there is a positive finite measure $v$ on $\Gamma$ such that

$$
T=\int_{\Gamma} T_{\gamma} d v(\gamma) \text { and }\|T\|=\int_{\Gamma}\left\|T_{\gamma}\right\| d v(\gamma)
$$

## Theorem (L. Frerick, L.L., J. Wengenroth)

For any compact set $K$, the space of restrictions to $K$ of continuously differentiable function on $\mathbb{R}^{d}$ is dense in $\left(C^{1}(K),\|\cdot\|_{C^{1}(K)}\right)$.

## Criterium for the equality $C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)=C^{1}(K)($ L. Frerick, L.L., J. Wengenroth)

$C^{1}(K)=C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)$ with equivalent norms if and only if $K$ has only finitely many components which are all Whitney regular.

> Criterium for the equality $C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)=C^{1}(K)($ L. Frerick, L.L., J. Wengenroth)
> $C^{1}(K)=C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)$ with equivalent norms if and only if $K$ has only finitely many components which are all Whitney regular.

> This is a satisfying answer in the context of Banach spaces, not in general.

## Criterium for the equality $C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)=C^{1}(K)($ L. Frerick, L.L., J. Wengenroth)

$C^{1}(K)=C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)$ with equivalent norms if and only if $K$ has only finitely many components which are all Whitney regular.

This is a satisfying answer in the context of Banach spaces, not in general.
Remark : the equality $C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)=C^{1}(K)$ has very poor stability properties.

## Criterium for the equality $C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)=C^{1}(K)($ L. Frerick, L.L., J. Wengenroth)

$C^{1}(K)=C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)$ with equivalent norms if and only if $K$ has only finitely many components which are all Whitney regular.

This is a satisfying answer in the context of Banach spaces, not in general.
Remark : the equality $C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)=C^{1}(K)$ has very poor stability properties.

- Two half of a broken heart behave better than the intact heart...


## Criterium for the equality $C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)=C^{1}(K)($ L. Frerick, L.L., J. Wengenroth)

$C^{1}(K)=C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)$ with equivalent norms if and only if $K$ has only finitely many components which are all Whitney regular.

This is a satisfying answer in the context of Banach spaces, not in general.
Remark : the equality $C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)=C^{1}(K)$ has very poor stability properties.

- Two half of a broken heart behave better than the intact heart...
- For $M=\{0\} \cup\left\{2^{-n}: n \in \mathbb{N}\right\}$ and $K=M \times[0,1]$ we have $C^{1}(K) \neq C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{2} \mid K\right)$.

$$
C^{1}(K) \subsetneq C_{\mathrm{int}}^{1}(K)
$$

$$
C^{1}(K) \subsetneq C_{\text {int }}^{1}(K)
$$

Let us denote by $C$ the ternary Cantor set and $U$ its complement in $(0,1)$. The open set $\Omega$ is build from $U \times(0,1)$ by removing from it disjoints balls $\left(B_{j}\right)_{j \in \mathbb{N}}$ that accumulate at $C \times[0,1]$.

$$
C^{1}(K) \subsetneq C_{\text {int }}^{1}(K)
$$

Let us denote by $C$ the ternary Cantor set and $U$ its complement in $(0,1)$. The open set $\Omega$ is build from $U \times(0,1)$ by removing from it disjoints balls $\left(B_{j}\right)_{j \in \mathbb{N}}$ that accumulate at $C \times[0,1]$.
$K=\bar{\Omega}$ is topologically regular.

$$
C^{1}(K) \subsetneq C_{\mathrm{int}}^{1}(K)
$$

Let us denote by $C$ the ternary Cantor set and $U$ its complement in $(0,1)$. The open set $\Omega$ is build from $U \times(0,1)$ by removing from it disjoints balls $\left(B_{j}\right)_{j \in \mathbb{N}}$ that accumulate at $C \times[0,1]$.
$K=\bar{\Omega}$ is topologically regular.
If $f$ is the Cantor function on $[0,1]$, we consider the function $F$ defined on $K$ by $F(x, y)=f(x)$.

$$
C^{1}(K) \subsetneq C_{i n t}^{1}(K)
$$

Let us denote by $C$ the ternary Cantor set and $U$ its complement in $(0,1)$. The open set $\Omega$ is build from $U \times(0,1)$ by removing from it disjoints balls $\left(B_{j}\right)_{j \in \mathbb{N}}$ that accumulate at $C \times[0,1]$.
$K=\bar{\Omega}$ is topologically regular.
If $f$ is the Cantor function on $[0,1]$, we consider the function $F$ defined on $K$ by $F(x, y)=f(x)$. We have $F \in C_{\text {int }}^{1}(K)$ because it is continuous and $\partial_{1} F=\partial_{2} F=0$ on $\Omega=\stackrel{\circ}{K}$.

$$
C^{1}(K) \subsetneq C_{\mathrm{int}}^{1}(K)
$$

Let us denote by $C$ the ternary Cantor set and $U$ its complement in $(0,1)$. The open set $\Omega$ is build from $U \times(0,1)$ by removing from it disjoints balls $\left(B_{j}\right)_{j \in \mathbb{N}}$ that accumulate at $C \times[0,1]$.
$K=\bar{\Omega}$ is topologically regular.
If $f$ is the Cantor function on $[0,1]$, we consider the function $F$ defined on $K$ by $F(x, y)=f(x)$. We have $F \in C_{\text {int }}^{1}(K)$ because it is continuous and $\partial_{1} F=\partial_{2} F=0$ on $\Omega=\stackrel{\circ}{K}$.

If $F \in C^{1}(K), d F=(0,0)$ and if we consider the path $\gamma$ consisting of one horizontal lines crossing $K$

$$
C^{1}(K) \subsetneq C_{\text {int }}^{1}(K)
$$

Let us denote by $C$ the ternary Cantor set and $U$ its complement in $(0,1)$. The open set $\Omega$ is build from $U \times(0,1)$ by removing from it disjoints balls $\left(B_{j}\right)_{j \in \mathbb{N}}$ that accumulate at $C \times[0,1]$.
$K=\bar{\Omega}$ is topologically regular.
If $f$ is the Cantor function on $[0,1]$, we consider the function $F$ defined on $K$ by $F(x, y)=f(x)$. We have $F \in C_{\text {int }}^{1}(K)$ because it is continuous and $\partial_{1} F=\partial_{2} F=0$ on $\Omega=\stackrel{\circ}{K}$.

If $F \in C^{1}(K), d F=(0,0)$ and if we consider the path $\gamma$ consisting of one horizontal lines crossing $K$, we have

$$
\int_{\gamma} d F=0 \quad \text { while } \quad F(\gamma(1))-F(\gamma(0))=f(1)-f(0)=1
$$

## Whitney (1934)

Let $K$ be a topologically regular compact set. If $K$ is Whitney regular, then $C_{\text {int }}^{1}(K)=C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)$.

## Whitney (1934)

Let $K$ be a topologically regular compact set. If $\stackrel{\circ}{K}$ is Whitney regular, then $C_{\text {int }}^{1}(K)=C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)$.

Whitney conjecture: what about the reverse?

## Whitney (1934)

Let $K$ be a topologically regular compact set. If $\stackrel{\circ}{K}$ is Whitney regular, then $C_{\text {int }}^{1}(K)=C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \mid K\right)$.

Whitney conjecture : what about the reverse?

## Criterium for the equality $C^{1}(K)=C_{\text {int }}^{1}(K)($ L. Frerick, L.L., J. Wengenroth)

Let $K$ be a topologically regular compact set and assume that, for all $x \in \partial K$, there exist $C_{x}>0$ and a neighbourhood $V_{x}$ of $x$ such that each $y \in V_{x}$ can be joined from $x$ by a rectifiable path in $\check{K} \cup\{x, y\}$ of length bounded by $C_{x}|x-y|$. Then $C_{\text {int }}^{1}(K)=C^{1}(K)$.

Let $\Omega$ be the open unit disk in $\mathbb{R}^{2}$ from which we remove tiny disjoints balls which accumulate at $\{0\} \times\left(-\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}\right)$.

Let $\Omega$ be the open unit disk in $\mathbb{R}^{2}$ from which we remove tiny disjoints balls which accumulate at $\{0\} \times\left(-\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}\right)$. Then $K=\bar{\Omega}$ is connected, topologically regular and Whitney regular.

Let $\Omega$ be the open unit disk in $\mathbb{R}^{2}$ from which we remove tiny disjoints balls which accumulate at $\{0\} \times\left(-\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}\right)$. Then $K=\bar{\Omega}$ is connected, topologically regular and Whitney regular. In particular we know that $C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{2} \mid K\right)=C^{1}(K)$.
$K$ is not Whitney regular, because $\{0\} \times\left(-\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}\right)$ is not contained in $\stackrel{\circ}{K}$

Let $\Omega$ be the open unit disk in $\mathbb{R}^{2}$ from which we remove tiny disjoints balls which accumulate at $\{0\} \times\left(-\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}\right)$. Then $K=\bar{\Omega}$ is connected, topologically regular and Whitney regular. In particular we know that $C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{2} \mid K\right)=C^{1}(K)$.
$\mathcal{K}$ is not Whitney regular, because $\{0\} \times\left(-\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}\right)$ is not contained in $K$, but the assumptions of the previous criterium are satisfied

Let $\Omega$ be the open unit disk in $\mathbb{R}^{2}$ from which we remove tiny disjoints balls which accumulate at $\{0\} \times\left(-\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}\right)$. Then $K=\bar{\Omega}$ is connected, topologically regular and Whitney regular. In particular we know that $C^{1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{2} \mid K\right)=C^{1}(K)$.
$\stackrel{\circ}{K}$ is not Whitney regular, because $\{0\} \times\left(-\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}\right)$ is not contained in $K$, but the assumptions of the previous criterium are satisfied and $C^{1}(K)=C_{\text {int }}^{1}(K)$.

Equality between $C^{1}(K)$ and $C^{1}(\mathbb{R} \mid K)$

Equality between $C^{1}(K)$ and $C^{1}(\mathbb{R} \mid K)$
$K$ compact set of $\mathbb{R}$ with infinitely many connected components, for all $\xi \in K$

$$
\sigma(\xi):=\lim _{\varepsilon \rightarrow 0^{+}} \sup \left\{\frac{\sup \{|y-\xi|: y \in G\}}{\ell(G)}: G \operatorname{gap} \subseteq(\xi-\varepsilon, \xi+\varepsilon)\right\}
$$

Equality between $C^{1}(K)$ and $C^{1}(\mathbb{R} \mid K)$
$K$ compact set of $\mathbb{R}$ with infinitely many connected components, for all $\xi \in K$

$$
\sigma(\xi):=\lim _{\varepsilon \rightarrow 0^{+}} \sup \left\{\frac{\sup \{|y-\xi|: y \in G\}}{\ell(G)}: G \text { gap } \subseteq(\xi-\varepsilon, \xi+\varepsilon)\right\}
$$

## Theorem (L. Frerick, L.L., J. Wengenroth)

Let $K \subset \mathbb{R}$ be a compact set with infinitely many connected components. We have $C^{1}(K)=C^{1}(\mathbb{R} \mid K)$ if and only if $\sigma(\xi)<\infty$ for all $\xi \in K$.

$$
\sigma(\xi):=\lim _{\varepsilon \rightarrow 0^{+}} \sup \left\{\frac{\sup \{|y-\xi|: y \in G\}}{\ell(G)}: G \text { gap } \subseteq(\xi-\varepsilon, \xi+\varepsilon)\right\}
$$

$$
\sigma(\xi):=\lim _{\varepsilon \rightarrow 0^{+}} \sup \left\{\frac{\sup \{|y-\xi|: y \in G\}}{\ell(G)}: G \operatorname{gap} \subseteq(\xi-\varepsilon, \xi+\varepsilon)\right\}
$$

(1) The Cantor set $K$ satisfies $\sigma(\xi)=\infty$ for all $\xi \in K$ so that $C^{1}(K) \neq C^{1}(\mathbb{R} \mid K)$.
$\sigma(\xi):=\lim _{\varepsilon \rightarrow 0^{+}} \sup \left\{\frac{\sup \{|y-\xi|: y \in G\}}{\ell(G)}: G\right.$ gap $\left.\subseteq(\xi-\varepsilon, \xi+\varepsilon)\right\}$
(1) The Cantor set $K$ satisfies $\sigma(\xi)=\infty$ for all $\xi \in K$ so that $C^{1}(K) \neq C^{1}(\mathbb{R} \mid K)$.
(2) $K=\{0\} \cup\left\{x_{n}: n \in \mathbb{N}\right\}$ for decreasing sequences $x_{n} \rightarrow 0$.
$\sigma(\xi):=\lim _{\varepsilon \rightarrow 0^{+}} \sup \left\{\frac{\sup \{|y-\xi|: y \in G\}}{\ell(G)}: G\right.$ gap $\left.\subseteq(\xi-\varepsilon, \xi+\varepsilon)\right\}$
(1) The Cantor set $K$ satisfies $\sigma(\xi)=\infty$ for all $\xi \in K$ so that $C^{1}(K) \neq C^{1}(\mathbb{R} \mid K)$.
(2) $K=\{0\} \cup\left\{x_{n}: n \in \mathbb{N}\right\}$ for decreasing sequences $x_{n} \rightarrow 0$.

- $\sigma\left(x_{n}\right)=0$ for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$
$\sigma(\xi):=\lim _{\varepsilon \rightarrow 0^{+}} \sup \left\{\frac{\sup \{|y-\xi|: y \in G\}}{\ell(G)}: G\right.$ gap $\left.\subseteq(\xi-\varepsilon, \xi+\varepsilon)\right\}$
(1) The Cantor set $K$ satisfies $\sigma(\xi)=\infty$ for all $\xi \in K$ so that $C^{1}(K) \neq C^{1}(\mathbb{R} \mid K)$.
(2) $K=\{0\} \cup\left\{x_{n}: n \in \mathbb{N}\right\}$ for decreasing sequences $x_{n} \rightarrow 0$.
- $\sigma\left(x_{n}\right)=0$ for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$
- $\sigma(0)=\lim \sup \frac{x_{n}}{x_{n}-x_{n+1}}$
$\sigma(\xi):=\lim _{\varepsilon \rightarrow 0^{+}} \sup \left\{\frac{\sup \{|y-\xi|: y \in G\}}{\ell(G)}: G \operatorname{gap} \subseteq(\xi-\varepsilon, \xi+\varepsilon)\right\}$
(1) The Cantor set $K$ satisfies $\sigma(\xi)=\infty$ for all $\xi \in K$ so that $C^{1}(K) \neq C^{1}(\mathbb{R} \mid K)$.
(2) $K=\{0\} \cup\left\{x_{n}: n \in \mathbb{N}\right\}$ for decreasing sequences $x_{n} \rightarrow 0$.
- $\sigma\left(x_{n}\right)=0$ for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$
- $\sigma(0)=\lim \sup \frac{x_{n}}{x_{n}-x_{n+1}}$
$\Rightarrow$ Finite for fast sequences like $x_{n}=a^{-n}$ with $a>1$ but infinite for slower sequences like $x_{n}=n^{-p}$ for $p>0$
$\sigma(\xi):=\lim _{\varepsilon \rightarrow 0^{+}} \sup \left\{\frac{\sup \{|y-\xi|: y \in G\}}{\ell(G)}: G \operatorname{gap} \subseteq(\xi-\varepsilon, \xi+\varepsilon)\right\}$
(1) The Cantor set $K$ satisfies $\sigma(\xi)=\infty$ for all $\xi \in K$ so that $C^{1}(K) \neq C^{1}(\mathbb{R} \mid K)$.
(2) $K=\{0\} \cup\left\{x_{n}: n \in \mathbb{N}\right\}$ for decreasing sequences $x_{n} \rightarrow 0$.
- $\sigma\left(x_{n}\right)=0$ for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$
- $\sigma(0)=\lim \sup \frac{x_{n}}{x_{n}-x_{n+1}}$
$\Rightarrow$ Finite for fast sequences like $x_{n}=a^{-n}$ with $a>1$ but infinite for slower sequences like $x_{n}=n^{-p}$ for $p>0$
(3) $K=\{0\} \cup \bigcup_{n \in \mathbb{N}}\left[x_{n}, x_{n}+r_{n}\right]$
$\sigma(\xi):=\lim _{\varepsilon \rightarrow 0^{+}} \sup \left\{\frac{\sup \{|y-\xi|: y \in G\}}{\ell(G)}: G \operatorname{gap} \subseteq(\xi-\varepsilon, \xi+\varepsilon)\right\}$
(1) The Cantor set $K$ satisfies $\sigma(\xi)=\infty$ for all $\xi \in K$ so that $C^{1}(K) \neq C^{1}(\mathbb{R} \mid K)$.
(2) $K=\{0\} \cup\left\{x_{n}: n \in \mathbb{N}\right\}$ for decreasing sequences $x_{n} \rightarrow 0$.
- $\sigma\left(x_{n}\right)=0$ for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$
- $\sigma(0)=\lim \sup \frac{x_{n}}{x_{n}-x_{n+1}}$
$\Rightarrow$ Finite for fast sequences like $x_{n}=a^{-n}$ with $a>1$ but infinite for slower sequences like $x_{n}=n^{-p}$ for $p>0$
(3) $K=\{0\} \cup \bigcup_{n \in \mathbb{N}}\left[x_{n}, x_{n}+r_{n}\right]$ For $r_{n}=e^{-2 n}$ we get $\sigma(0)<\infty$, e.g., for $x_{n}=e^{-n}$ and $\sigma(0)=\infty$ for $x_{n}=1 / n$
$\sigma(\xi):=\lim _{\varepsilon \rightarrow 0^{+}} \sup \left\{\frac{\sup \{|y-\xi|: y \in G\}}{\ell(G)}: \quad G \operatorname{gap} \subseteq(\xi-\varepsilon, \xi+\varepsilon)\right\}$


To go further :

Leonhard Frerick, Laurent Loosveldt and Jochen Wengenroth, Continously differentiable functions on compact sets, Submitted for publication.

To go further :

Leonhard Frerick, Laurent Loosveldt and Jochen Wengenroth, Continously differentiable functions on compact sets, Submitted for publication.

Available on arXiv.

